

Collaboration and Public Involvement Summary

Introduction

Recognizing that our partners and publics have valuable ideas, knowledge, opinions, and needs that can inform and improve management of the Kaibab National Forest, the planning team developed a public involvement plan designed to provide opportunities for meaningful dialogue and collaboration throughout the plan revision process. A synopsis and listing of the key collaborative processes are listed below.

2006 Public Meetings

Public involvement for the Kaibab NF plan revision was initiated in the fall of 2006 under the direction of the 2005 Planning Rule with two sets of public meetings held in the surrounding communities (Williams, Flagstaff, North Kaibab, and Tusayan). Meetings were also held in Phoenix which were jointly hosted with the Coconino NF. The first set of meetings provided an overview of the plan revision process, and included facilitated small group sessions that focused on likes/vision/desired conditions and dislikes/needs for changes. The second set of meetings reported back on the content from the first set of meetings and then followed up with more specific questions to drill down to gain additional detail and insight.

2006 Agency Meetings

In November 2006, the Coconino and Kaibab National Forests held a multiagency plan revision meeting. This was attended by the National Park Service, Arizona State Parks, Coconino County, Yavapai County, Fish and Wildlife Service, Arizona State Forestry, Arizona Game and Fish Department, and City of Flagstaff. This meeting reviewed the public comment process to date and asked for information from each agency that would be helpful in the plan revision effort. The majority of participants asked to stay informed via agency briefings.

2007 Working Group Meetings

In an effort to obtain more targeted public participation related to evaluating sustainability and identifying management needs for change, working group meetings were held on species diversity, ecosystem diversity, social and economic sustainability, and special areas. All working group meetings were advertised and open to the public. Input received during the working group meetings were used to prepare the “Ecological Sustainability Report,” “Social and Economic Sustainability Report,” and “Comprehensive Evaluation Report.” These reports are all available on the Kaibab National Forest Web site at: http://fs.usda.gov/goto/kaibab/plan_revision

In March of 2007, the 2005 Planning Rule was enjoined. While the forest was able to work internally on specific products, public meetings were put on hold until direction was provided about how forests were to continue with forest planning. The Southwestern Region decided to move forward in a “rule neutral” manner.

In January 2008, the Coconino and Kaibab National Forests held a multiagency and public meeting to share how the forests intended to go forward in forest plan revision in a planning rule neutral manner. Public input was sought on the products to date, and how the forest should move into finalizing the first phase of revision. In the fall of 2008, a new planning rule was in place (2008 Rule) and the Kaibab NF, adjusted its planning process to ensure conformance.

Tribal Meetings

Due to the level of use of the forest by tribal members and the unique interests of area tribes, the Kaibab National Forest conducted extensive tribal consultation and scoping of tribal communities throughout the forest plan revision process. This consultation process reflects a long standing commitment by the Kaibab National Forest to share the stewardship of public lands with area tribes. Throughout the plan revision process, tribal consultation was conducted at the government-to-government level with concerned tribes according to established memoranda of understanding and pertinent laws and regulations. Additionally, the forest scoped tribal communities and individual tribal members that use the forest. These efforts were made to assure that affected tribal publics were given the opportunity to participate in the planning process as required by the National Environmental Policy Act and other laws and regulations. In more than 30 face-to-face meetings, a wide range of concerns were raised related to almost every aspect of land management. The primary tribal concerns were about increased development on the forest, extractive undertakings such as uranium mining, and continued access to ceremonial sites and forest products for traditional and cultural purposes.

In August 2007, the Kaibab National Forest hosted an intertribal meeting in Williams, AZ. During the meeting, the forest conducted a forest plan revision workshop with tribal representatives. The workshop was attended by representatives of the Havasupai Tribe, Hopi Tribe, Hualapai Tribe Kaibab Band of Paiute Indians, Navajo Nation, Yavapai-Prescott Indian Tribe, Yavapai-Apache Nation, and Tonto Apache Tribe.

In accordance with the 2008 Planning Rule, a notice of initiation to revise the Kaibab NF forest plan was published in the Federal Register and Arizona Daily Sun in April of 2009. Concurrently, the comprehensive evaluation report (CER) was made available to the public online and hard copy. The CER specified the management needs for change that would serve to focus the plan revision effort. The NOI initiated another round of public meetings as well as several efforts specifically designed to develop content for the plan and alternatives.

2009 Kaibab Forest Health Focus

The Kaibab NF sponsored a series of science based, collaborative meetings to prioritize treatment areas and provide guidance for forest restoration treatments for use in revising the Kaibab forest plan and guide future landscape level forest restoration efforts. The forest formed a partnership with Northern Arizona University's Lab of Landscape Ecology and Conservation Biology to host a collaborative forum on forest health supported by spatial modeling and analysis. The effort drew from, and expanded upon previous collaborative assessments and analysis including the Western Mogollon Plateau Landscape Assessment (WMPALA), the Statewide Strategy for Restoring Arizona's Forests, and the Analysis of Small-diameter Wood Supply for Northern Arizona. The effort produced a series of recommendations used to develop desired conditions, objectives, and guidelines in the initial working draft plan. A detailed report can be accessed on the Kaibab National Forest website at: http://fs.usda.gov/goto/kaibab/plan_revision

Following publication of the CER, but prior to the public meetings that were scheduled to follow, the 2008 Planning Rule was enjoined. A Federal District Court order issued in June of 2009 reinstated the 2000 Planning Rule, which included transition provisions to revise plans under the earlier 1982 Rule (section 219.35). In an effort to maintain momentum and capitalize on the collaborative efforts and analysis to date, the Kaibab NF decided to continue with the plan revision effort under the provisions of the 1982 Rule.

2009 Public Meetings

Public meetings were held in Fredonia and Williams sharing the needs for change and soliciting input on possible wilderness, research natural areas, and wild and scenic river recommendations. Due to recent legal actions and subsequent changes to the plan revision process, the intent to proceed under the 82 Rule Provisions and its differing requirements were also a topic of discussion.

2009-2010 “Collaborwriting” Workshops

The Kaibab hosted five workshops for developing specific plan content for aspen, grasslands, springs, mixed conifer, and recreation. The workshops used a groupware tool called “collaborwriting” which served like an electronic flipchart onto which everyone could view and type comments at the same time. Facilitated follow up enabled exploring themes, seeking detail, and gaining clarification. This tool allowed for: (1) a lot of content to be captured in a short time; (2) the exact words and intent to be preserved; (3) the meeting content to be immediately available as it did not need to be transcribed; and (4) quieter participants an opportunity to express themselves and prevented more vocal participants from monopolizing.

In conjunction with the collaborwriting workshops there was an online component that shared the workshop content. The idea was to build on the workshop content, but there was limited participation and it did not yield additional content. A final Collaborwriting session was held following the comment period on the draft plan to address issues and develop alternatives.

Wildlife and Monitoring Topic Workshops

Due to the complexity and also public interest in wildlife issues and monitoring/adaptive management, two additional workshops were held. Both of these workshops had participants from Arizona Game and Fish, U.S. Fish and Wildlife, environmental groups, academia, and other agency personnel. Attendees represented a wide range of expertise in the fields of forestry, fire, restoration, wildlife, and spatial ecology, among others. Recommendations from these collaborations were integrated into various aspects of the draft Forest Plan and/or wildlife viability analysis. Specifically, these workshops entailed the Viability and MIS selection process for wildlife, and development of the Monitoring Plan. The first workshop detailed procedural aspects of the viability process for wildlife. This included an overview of the course/fine-filter approach for mitigating risk, the subsequent development of plan components to address species-specific needs, and the Management Indicator Species selection process. The Monitoring workshop detailed the Forest’s general visions for future monitoring and focused only on those resource areas and monitoring questions which were high priority needs. Several presentations were given by KNF collaborators as well as Forest Service staff highlighting current efforts to date, followed by an open discussion to identify additional needs and or knowledge/data gaps which could assist the Forest with further monitoring plan refinement.

Coordination with State, Federal and Local Governments

Coordination with State, Federal, and local governments occurred throughout the planning process. A majority of the coordination that resulted in substantive plan language was around topics of mutual interests such as wildlife management, potential wilderness areas, and managing across agency boundaries. More formal presentations and briefings were held with State, local and Federal elected officials including the city of Williams, town of Fredonia, town of Tusayan, Coconino County Board of Supervisors, and congressional representatives. The briefings and presentations focused on issues and key topics such as continued economic uses, access, and protections.

Information Made Available to the Public on the Forest Plan Revision Web Site

Under the 2008 Planning Rule, three reports were prepared and released to the public: the “Economic and Social Sustainability Assessment” was released in August of 2008; the “Ecological Sustainability Report” was released in December 2008, and the “Comprehensive Evaluation Report” was released in April of 2009. These reports were made available at public meetings, on the Kaibab NF Web site, and by request. A notice of initiation was published in the Federal Register in April of 2009 announcing the availability of these reports, as well as the forest’s intent to revise its forest plan based on identified needs for change.

In order to meet the requirements of the 1982 Planning Rule Provisions, an analysis of the management situation (AMS) was prepared. Availability of the AMS and the initial working draft plan was published in the Federal Register with a notice of intent on April 24, 2010.

Over a year and a half period, four iterations of the Kaibab working draft forest plan were posted to the Website. While the official comment period was in the 2 months following release of the initial working draft plan, comments were received throughout the process that were used to modify and refine language in the working draft for the proposed plan and alternatives.

Table 1. Listing of key collaboration and public involvement meetings and discussions

Date	Meeting	Location
6/8/2006	Meeting with Governor’s Oversight Council on Forest Health	Flagstaff, AZ
6/22/2006	Hopi Tribe and Hopi CRATT	Kykotsmovi, AZ
7/6/2006	Kaibab Paiute Band of Indians Tribal Council	Pipe Springs, AZ
9/19/2006	1 st round – public meeting	Williams, AZ
9/20/2006	1 st round – public meeting	Flagstaff, AZ
9/21/2006	1 st round – public meeting	Kanab, UT
9/22/2006	1 st round – public meeting	Tusayan, AZ
10/7/2006	1 st round – public meeting	Phoenix, AZ
10/12/2006	2 nd round – public meeting	Kanab, UT
10/18/2006	2 nd round – public meeting	Williams, AZ
10/19/2006	2 nd round – public meeting	Flagstaff, AZ
10/20/2006	2 nd round – public meeting	Tusayan, AZ
11/17/2006	Governments meeting (joint w/Coconino)	Phoenix, AZ
11/18/2006	2 nd round – public meeting (joint w/Coconino)	Phoenix, AZ
12/17/2006	Cameron Chapter Meeting of Western Navajo	Cameron, AZ
12/18/2006	Navajo Forestry Department	Fort Defiance, AZ
1/31/2007	Navajo Nation (joint meeting with Coconino NF)	Window Rock, AZ
2/5/2007	Havasupai Tribal Council	Tusayan, AZ
2/15/2007	Bodaway/Gap Chapter of Western Navajo	Gap, AZ

Date	Meeting	Location
2/21/2007	Hopi Tribe	Kykotsmovi, AZ
3/11/2007	Coppermine Chapter of Western Navajo Agency	Red Mesa, AZ
5/30/2007	Navajo Nation	Window Rock, AZ
7/11/2007	Havasupai Tribe	Conference Call
8/7/2007	Multitribal Meeting	Williams, AZ
11/19/2007	Navajo Nation	Window Rock, AZ
12/18/2007	Field trip to Chuska Mountains w/Navajo Forestry	Navajo, AZ
12/19/2007	Hopi Natural Resources	Kykotsmovi, AZ
1/12/2008	Joint Meeting w/Coconino Multistakeholder	Flagstaff, AZ
1/28/2008	Kaibab Paiute Tribe	Fredonia, AZ
2/14/2008	Navajo Nation	Flagstaff, AZ
2/19/2008	Yavapai-Prescott Indian Tribe	Williams, AZ
2/20/2008	Hopi Tribe	Kykotsmovi, AZ
3/4/2008	Hualapai Tribal Chair and Staff	Peach Springs, AZ
3/18/2008	Havasupai Tribal Council	Tusayan, AZ
3/19/2008	Kaibab Paiute Tribe	Pipe Springs, AZ
4/22/2008	G&F Coordination Meeting	Flagstaff, AZ
5/1/2008	Bat Meeting at AZ Game and Fish	Flagstaff, AZ
7/15/2008	Attend Navajo Natural Resources Conference	Flagstaff, AZ
9/2/2008	First Multitribe meeting	Williams, AZ
9/3/2008	Hopi Tribe, Kaibab Band of Paiute Indian, Hualapai Tribe, Navajo Nation	Williams, AZ
11/5/2008	Attend ADOT Statewide Transportation Meeting	Flagstaff, AZ
1/21/2009	Forest Health Focus – Meeting 1	Flagstaff, AZ
2/18/2009	Forest Health Focus – Meeting 2	Flagstaff, AZ
4/28/2009	Forest Health Focus – Meeting 3	Flagstaff, AZ
6/2/2009	Forest Health Focus – Meeting 4	Flagstaff, AZ
8/26/2009	Public Meeting – Rollout of Comprehensive Evaluation Report	Williams, AZ
8/27/2009	Public Meeting – Rollout of Comprehensive Evaluation Report	Fredonia, AZ
9/3/2009	Triforest Leadership Meeting; Presentation to RF	Williams, AZ
9/28/2009	Multitribe Meeting	Williams, AZ
12/14/2009	Collaborwriting Workshop: Grasslands	Flagstaff, AZ
12/17/2009	Collaborwriting Workshops: Aspen and Springs	Flagstaff, AZ

Date	Meeting	Location
01/19/2010	Collaborwriting Workshop: Recreation	Flagstaff, AZ
2/2/2010	Mixed Conifer Topic Meeting	Flagstaff, AZ
3/2/2010	FWS Meeting	Flagstaff, AZ
3/4/2010	Pueblo of Zuni	Zuni, NM
3/10/2010	Hualapai Tribe	Peach Springs, AZ
3/12/2010	Navajo Nation	Window Rock, AZ
3/26/2010	Hopi Tribe (Hopi Vice Chairman and Other Hopi Staff)	Kykotsmovi, AZ
4/1/2010	AZGF Coordination Meeting	Flagstaff, AZ
4/6/2010	Havasupai-FPR Briefing for Council	Havasue, AZ
5/13/2010	Fredonia Public Meeting	Fredonia, AZ
6/7/2010	Kaibab-Paiute Community Meeting	Pipe Springs, AZ
6/15/2010	Wildlife Issues and Analysis Topic Meeting	Flagstaff, AZ
6/16/2010	Meeting with AZ Coalition of Conservation Groups	Flagstaff, AZ
7/15/2010	Meet w/Wildlands Council	Flagstaff, AZ
7/29/2010	Collaborwriting Workshop: Issues and Alternatives Meeting	Flagstaff, AZ
8/3/2010	Meet w/Andi Rodgers (AZ G&F)	Flagstaff, AZ
8/24/2010	Monitoring and Adaptive Management Workshop	Williams, AZ
9/2/2010	Meet w/Alicyn Gitlin Sierra Club	Flagstaff, AZ
9/15/2010	Intertribal Meeting	Williams, AZ
9/21/2010	Attend Sierra Club "Meet and Greet"	Flagstaff, AZ
10/22/2010	Call with Wildlands Council (Kim Crumbo) re: Alternatives	Conference Call
10/27/2010	Attend Society of American Foresters, present poster on "Collaborwriting"	Albuquerque, NM
11/21/2010	Conference Call with Sierra Club to Discuss Alternatives	Conference Call
1/13/2011	Meet w/Sierra Club	Flagstaff, AZ
2/15/2011	Yavapai-Prescott Indian Tribe	Prescott, AZ
2/16/2011	Hualapai Tribe	Peach Springs, AZ
2/23/2011	Pueblo of Zuni	Zuni, NM
2/24/2011	Meet w/Fish and Wildlife	Flagstaff, AZ
2/24/2011	Navajo Nation	Window Rock, AZ
3/1/2011	Presentation to WFAC	Williams, AZ
3/9/2011	Havasupai Tribe	Flagstaff, AZ
3/14/2011	Presentation at Sierra Club Meeting (joint w/Coconino NF)	Flagstaff, AZ
3/23/2011	Hopi Tribe	Kykotsmovi, AZ

Date	Meeting	Location
4/6/2011	AZ Game and Fish Coordination	Flagstaff, AZ
4/26/2011	Coordination Meeting with U.S. Fish & Wildlife Service	Flagstaff, AZ
6/2/2011	Meet with Game & Fish to Discuss Viability MIS	Flagstaff, AZ
9/13/2011	Participate in Tribal Climate Change Workshop	Flagstaff, AZ
9/21/2011	Tusayan Town Council	Tusayan, AZ
9/22/2011	City of Williams Council	Williams, AZ
9/27/2011	Fredonia Town Council	Fredonia, AZ
10/5/2011	Briefing with Congressman Gosar's Staff	Washington, DC
10/6/2011	Briefing with Senator Kyl's Staff	Washington, DC
10/7/2011	Briefing with Senator McCain's Staff	Washington, DC
10/24/2011	Kaibab Forest Plan Related Posters/presentations Biennial Conference	Flagstaff, AZ
10/25/2011	Wildlands Council/Sierra Club (Kim Crumbo, Lynn Nemeth, Alicyn Gitlin)	Flagstaff, AZ
10/26/2011	Monitoring Workshop 4FRI Science & Mon	Flagstaff, AZ
11/8/2011	Presentation to Southern Utah Planning Authorities Council	Kanab, UT
12/14/2011	Meet with County Supervisors Matt Ryan, Carl Taylor, Lena Fowler.	Flagstaff, AZ